Climate Smart Community Based Disaster Risk Reduction in the Mekong

GUIDELINES

LIVELIHOOD BENEFICIARY SELECTION

Kien Giang: Community members seeking clarification on beneficiary selection in a hamlet meeting in Phu Loi Commune

2015

Background

The Climate Smart Community Based Disaster Risk Reduction Project (the Project) is jointly managed and implemented by Vietnam Red Cross, German Red Cross and Australian Red Cross. The project is funded by AusAID. The Project started in July 2012 and is implemented in 15 target communes in two provinces of An Giang and Kien Giang, with a focus on vulnerable groups including women, children, the elderly and people with disabilities.

The overall goal of the project is to increase the resilience of vulnerable communities in the Mekong Delta to the current and projected impacts of climate change.

Vietnam Red Cross' successful community based disaster risk reduction model is being utilized throughout the project, including a range of training in communities, schools and for emergency response teams, the development of early warning systems, and the provision of community resources and equipment. Climate change adaptation is also integrated, drawing on the Red Cross Red Crescent Movement's experience and expertise in Vietnam and the region in water and sanitation, health and livelihoods.

In the livelihood component, the Project wants to introduce climate resilient livelihood models, by which to increase income of local communities, especially those models suitable to the most vulnerable groups. Increasing local capacity in terms of livelihoods is one of the key criteria in building a resilient community to disaster risks and climate change.

As of VCA results, the need for livelihood support in the Project target communes is ample whereas Project interventions are limited. The question of how to select right households that are at most vulnerable, in real need of livelihood improvement and willing to carry out newly introduced livelihood models that may be different from traditional models but, at the same time, would not cause unnecessary conflicts in local communities is not easy for the Project team to answer.

Thanks to consultation with local governments, relevant stakeholders and experiences during the project implementation in 15 communes, the Project team would like to introduce Guidelines for beneficiary selection for livelihood support.

Vietnam Red Cross

Australian Red Cross

German Red Cross

Abbreviations

CPC	Commune People's Committee
CRC	Commune Red Cross
CS-CBDRR	Climate Smart Community Based Disaster Risk Reduction
DRC	District Red Cross Chapter
hhs	households
HQ	Headquarters
PRC	Provincial Red Cross Chapter
PWD	Person with Disability
VNRC	Vietnam Red Cross

Summary of steps in the process

Step 1	Local government (Commune People's Committee or CPC) select 1 hamlet with highest poverty rate in the communes for livelihood interventions
Step 2	CPC in collaboration with Commune Red Cross (CRC), Commune Fatherland Front and hamlet leader (hamlet selected in Step 1) to score all poor and near poor households (hhs) in the hamlet based on criteria (see Annex 1)
Step 3	CPC publicize selection criteria and scores of the poor and near poor households in CPC premise and hamlet's building, and read the scores on local loudspeaker systems for three days
Step 4	CPC meeting to pre-select 50 hhs with highest scores. Meeting minutes shall include signatures of all participants and be stamped by CPC (see Annex 3)
Step 5	Community/hamlet meeting (all 50 hhs in Step 4)
Step 6	Submit proposed beneficiaries to Chapter's Management Board
Step 7	Proposed list of beneficiaries are verified and approved
Step 8	CPC publicize the approved list of beneficiaries by posting on CPC premise, hamlet's building and reading on local loudspeaker systems for five days

1. Instructions for Step 1: selecting hamlet

CPC and CRC, based on current secondary data on poverty rate of all hamlets in the commune, select one hamlet with highest poverty rate.

Notes:

- One or more than one hamlets can be selected at this Step, up to the project budget

- On a trial phase, it is suggested to focus on one specific area to better measure and compare the intervention effectiveness. If the trial intervention is successful, advocacy with local government for rolling-out shall be done at the later stage.

2. Instruction for Step 2: scoring the poor and near poor

Based on current secondary data on poor hhs, near poor hhs, hhs with PWD, single headed woman, landless/landpoor hhs, etc., CPC in collaboration with CRC, local mass organizations and hamlet leader to score all poor and near poor hhs in the hamlet as per the scoring scale agree upon (see Annex 2).

Notes: Selection criteria and scoring scale shall be depending on project's goal and objectives.

3. Instruction for Step 3: publicizing scores

CPC publicize selection criteria and scores of all poor and near poor households in the selected hamlet at easy-to-see places at CPC premise and hamlet's building and read on local loudspeaker systems for three days.

CPC and CRC/DRC or provincial Red Cross Chapter address comments, complaints (if any) and adjust the scores accordingly.

4. Instruction for Step 4: pre-selecting beneficiaries

The scored list of all poor and near-poor hhs is sorted from highest to lowest scores. CPC have a meeting with CRC, local mass organizations and hamlet leader to select 50 hhs with highest scores. This pre-selection list is sent to provincial Chapter, together with meeting minute (see Annex 3).

Notes: Number of pre-selected households is determined based on project budget. If more than 50 hhs is pre-selected, there should be more than one hamlet meetings (in Step 5).

5. Instruction for Step 5: hamlet meeting

1. Agenda

- Together with selected households to review[1] the scores of 50 hhs as per agreed criteria

- Introduce resilient livelihood models previously agreed with local government

- Select prioritized households for livelihood support and identify livelihood model for each household. Based on the project budget allocated for each commune and supporting amount for each livelihood model, project staff will calculate number of households to be supported.

2. Specific notes in hamlet meetings

---

[1] In reality, during the implementation of the CS-CBDRR, commune/hamlet leaders together with community members score in public all the pre-selected households. The list is prepared on A0-size paper or black board (see Annex 1).

Description	Who	Support, Supervise
***Before* the hamlet meeting**		
1. Ensure that pre-selection list of 50 hhs are in place, in line with project criteria and process	CPC	P/D/CRC
2. Selection criteria are publicized in public places and read via loudspeaker systems	CPC	P/D/CRC
3. Meeting venue is at the center of the hamlet or at convenient place for all participants (especially the elderly, persons with disability)	Hamlet leader	CRC
4. All households in the pre-selection list are invited, attached with leaflets on livelihood models[2] for their study in advance. <u>Notes:</u> + Invitation is sent to households 3 to 5 days before the meeting + Participants should be head of households to be able to make decision on selecting livelihood model	Hamlet leader	CRC
5. Scores of 50 pre-selected hhs are posted at the meeting venue (with selection criteria)	Hamlet leader	CRC
***During* the hamlet meeting**		
6. Appoint a person to prepare meeting minutes (see Annex 4)	CPC	CRC
7. Introduce meeting objectives and brief project profile (timeframe, donor, implementer)		
8. Share the budget allotted for the commune and indicate that only certain households will be supported		
9. Re-introduce the beneficiary selection criteria and process	CPC	P/DRC
10. Review the scores for each of 50 hhs and adjust accordingly	CPC, hamlet leader	P/DRC
11. Introduce livelihood models (agreed with local government), project support and co-contributing amount from beneficiaries.	Agriculture/ extension staff	
12. 15 hhs[3] with highest scores definitely supported by the project will select livelihood model. If project budget is left after support to 15 hhs, the project staff will calculate how many more hhs can be supported, which will be selected from next prioritized in the score list.	CPC	PRC
13. Prepare proposed beneficiaries with livelihood model	CPC, CRC	

---

[2] Leaflets will be prepared and delivered by the project, including key information of the models and relevant costs (indicate what will be covered by the project, what to be contributed by hhs) for them to consider when selecting livelihood model.
[3] The Project introduce different livelihood options with different support amount. For instance, at the project budget of VND 120 million for each commune, maximum support for pig raising on bio-mattress is VND 8 million, maximum 15 hhs will be supported if all adopt this model. If some hhs adopt model at lower support rate, the project staff will calculate and decide how may more hhs can be supported.

6. Instructions for Step 6: Submit the proposed list to Project

CPC send the proposed beneficiary list to Provincial Red Cross Chapter, including:

- Scores of all the poor and near poor households in the hamlet (Annex 1)
- CPC meeting minutes for pre-selecting 50 hhs (Annex 3) & scores for these households
- Hamlet meeting minute (Annex 4)
- Proposed list of beneficiaries and livelihood model adopted (Annex 2)
- List of participants in the hamlet meeting

7. Instruction for Step 7: Verify and approve beneficiaries

VNRC headquarters and Chapter and/or PNS staff will pay visits to each of the proposed beneficiaries for verification based on criteria developed in Step 3. If any discrepancies from the proposed list, verification team needs to work with CPC and CRC to find out a solution (with a meeting minute, including recommendations).

CPC send the revised list following the verification and adjustment (if any) and meeting minute to Chapter.

Chapter Management Board compiles all beneficiary lists in the province and submit to VNRC HQ and PNS for approval.

8. Instructions for Step 8: Publicize approved beneficiaries

CPC publicize the approved beneficiaries by posting at CPC premise and hamlet building for five days and reading on loudspeaker systems, at least once a day in three days. Any comments can be received in a 'comment box' placed at CPC premise.

All feedback or comments on the selection process shall be shared with VNRC HQ and Chapter for appropriate solution.

Beneficiary selection process ends at this point. Further steps will be followed to implement the selected livelihood models.

Appendices

Annex 1: Beneficiary selection criteria and selection methodology

Annex 2: Template for proposed beneficiaries

Annex 3: Template for pre-selection meeting

Annex 4: Template for hamlet meeting

Annex 5: Case study for beneficiary selection process

Annex 1: Beneficiary selection criteria and selection methodology

1. Benficiary selection criteria

1.1 Essential criteria

- Household is ranked poor or near poor in the most updated rankings
- Household is capable of implementing adopted livelihood model (willingness, time, resources, co-funding).

1.2 Priotized criteria

Those households meet essential criteria, the following will be prioritized:

- Households having PWDs
- Households are landless or land-poor
- Households are headed by single women

2. Selection methodology

Beneficiaries are selected by *scoring* based on project criteria. Those households with higher scores will be ranked first in the selection, details:

- 30 scores for poor, 20 scores for near-poor
- 15 scores for PWDs
- 12 scores for landless/landpoor
- 10 scores for single headed woman

For those households at the same scores, the following will be prioritized (no scores):
- Priority 1: never be supported in livelihoods
- Priority 2: having female or children with disabilities
- Priority 3: having single elderly
- Priority 4: having children under five

In case all the above priority criteria are considered, many households are still equally scored, all participants should discuss to find out more prioritized households (e.g., ethnic minority, hhs with many children, etc.)

3. Table of scores

Seq.	Name of hhs head	Poor (30 scores)	Near poor (20 scores)	PWDs (15 scores)	Landless, landpoor (12 scores)	Single headed woman (bread-winner) (10 scores)	Total scores	Remarks (e.g., those are lazy, etc.)
1	Nguyễn Văn A							
2	Nguyễn Thị B							
3	…							

*(**Notes:** maximum scores if hhs meet each of the criteria, otherwise, note 0)*

Annex: Template for proposed beneficiary list

(Notes: This is similar to that in Annex 1 but the list is sorted from highest scores for proposed households only with livelihood model adopted)

Seq.	Name of hhs head	Poor (30 scores)	Near poor (20 scores)	PWDs (15 scores)	Landless, landpoor (12 scores)	Single headed woman (bread-winner) (10 scores)	Total scores	Livelihood model adopted
1	Nguyễn Văn A	30	0	15	12	10	**67**	Mushroom
2	Nguyễn Thị B	0	20	15	12	10	**57**	Pig raising
3	…							

Annex 3: Template for pre-selection meeting minute

BENEFICIARY PRE-SELECTION MINUTES

Project: ………………………………   *Donated by: …………………………………………*

This enters at …. hr, on …[date]…

This meeting is to score and pre-select beneficiaries for livelihood support under the Project at [hamlet], [commune], [district], [province].

1/ Participants:

Mr. ………

Ms ………

Mrs ………

Mr. ………

2/ Chairman

………

3/ Secretary

………

4/Meeting proceedings

………

………

The meeting minutes are endorsed at [time] with …% agreement. List of scored households is attached.

Hamlet leader   **Representative of local mass orgs**

Commune People's Committee   **Commune Red Cross**

Annex 4: Template for hamlet meeting

HAMLET MEETING MINUTE

***Project:** …………………………………*   ***Donated by:** ……………………………………………*

This enters at …. hr, on …[date]…

This meeting is to score and pre-select beneficiaries for livelihood support under the Project at [hamlet], [commune], [district], [province].

1/ Participants

CPC: ………………………………………………………………………………………

CRC: ………………………………………………………………………………….…

Others: ……………………………………………………………………………………

Community members: ………….. in which, poor: ………….. near poor …………..

Number of hhs at the beginning: ……… in which, … poor, …. near poor

Number of hhs at the end of the meeting: ……… in which, … poor, … near poor

Number or PWDs: ………………………………………………………………..

2/ Chairman of the meeting *(name, position)*

………………………………………………………………………………………………………

3/ Secretary/scribe *(name, position)*

………………………………………………………………………………………………………

4/ Meeting proceedings

………………………………………………………………………………………………………

………………………………………………………………………………………………………

………………………………………………………………………………………………………

5/ Challenges/problems in the meeting

(note down comments, complaints (if any) from participants and feedback, solution from the chairman)

……..

……

……

Following the selection, … hhs are proposed (with attached details) to receive livelihood support from the Project, with …% of agreement.

The meeting is finalized at … on the same day.

Hamlet leader   **Representative of local mass orgs**

Commune People's Committee   **Commune Red Cross**

Annex 5: Case study

Beneficiary selection process

One of the interventions under the Climate Smart Community Based Disaster Risk Reduction in the Mekong (CS-CBDRR) is to support vulnerable communities in target communes carrying out resilient livelihood models. The proposed livelihood models are resilient to climate change and suitable to vulnerable groups. Among 15 communes supported with resilient livelihood models, two communes of Dong Hung B from An Minh District in Kien Giang Province and Vinh Trung Commune from Tinh Bien District in An Giang Province are selected for case study. Pig raising on bio-mattress is the resilient livelihood model adopted in these two communes.

Beneficiaries are selected to implement the model based on a set of criteria and through a process including a numbers of steps, (i) select a hamlet at highest poverty rate, (ii) score all poor and near poor households in the selected hamlet based on criteria, (iii) publicize selection criteria and scores of the poor and near poor, (iv) pre-select 50 hhs, (v) hamlet meeting to propose beneficiaries and introduce resilient livelihood models, (vi) submit the proposed beneficiaries, (vii) verify and approve beneficiaries, (viii) publicize approved beneficiaries, and (ix) technical training to beneficiaries and implement the models.

In each commune, 16 households were selected to receive the project support for pig raising on bio-mattress. Until now, all households have finished their first production cycle and prepared for next cycle. In addition, another 15 households in Dong Hung B are rolling out this model from other funds. These 15 households are selected using the CS-CBDRR's selection process.

Conversations with commune staff, hamlet leaders, beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries advise that the selection process has been done well. No negative complaints on the selection process are recorded. Commune staff and hamlet leaders acknowledge that the most outstanding strengths are transparency and participation of communities through the process. Scoring based on criteria enables the selection process transparent and easy for all to follow.

In Dong Hung B Commune, from 90 households in the poor and near poor list of Vam Xang hamlet, only 16 were selected to receive support but no adverse feeback is received from non-supported households. Vinh Tay hamlet, selected for livelihood support in Vinh Trung Commune, is home to Khmer group with high poverty rate, which might raise challenges in selecting beneficiaries for livelihood support. Especially, the fact that selecting vulnerable households that are willing to implement the project model of pig raising on bio-mattress, which is new to Khmer group, has hesitated local governments. However, it turns out that after the process, commune staff, hamlet leaders and beneficiaries appreciate all steps in the process. Local government staff confirms that transparency in the publicizing selection criteria has contributed largely to the success of the process. Also, scoring for all households based on criteria is most favored by all and considered as important since all households can understand the criteria and cross check the scores.

However, commune staff shares that costs and efforts for the selection is quite high, especially Step 6 – verification of proposed beneficiaries. The verification will look at capacity to implement the adopted model, including commitment, willingness, time, resources, co-funding, land for pig pen. It took time to collect this information from each of the proposed households. In case of Vam Xang, the proposed households are spread out over a large area and difficult to access. In addition, information provided by households may be not correct.

As shared by the hamlet leader from Vinh Trung Commune, 'capacity to carry out the model' was not included in the criteria but this turned out an important element. He suggested to include criteria "willingness"and "capacity to implement the model" and "ethnic minority" in the score scale.

Recommendations

- Ensuring participation of community members throughout the process and providing clear and specific score scale are two outstanding strengths of the selection process which are appreciated by local government. Local government thought of applying this process in their own work, with some adjustment of criteria and weighted scores for target beneficiaries. Dong Hung B applied this process in selecting beneficiaries for another project. Both Dong Hung B and Vinh Trung Communes planned to apply this process in their annual poverty ranking. Vinh Trung Commune suggested giving more scores for those households that are willing to and capable of implementing the livelihood model.

- In order to lessen effort and time for the process, some steps can be omitted. For example, secondary data are already available in the commune and hamlet levels such as the poor, the near poor, single headed woman, single elderly, PWDs. Based on the budget allocated for each commune and requirements for each livelihood model, the number of households pre-selected and invited to hamlet meeting at Step 4 and 5 can be reduced.

This case is studied by Dr. Nguyen Tri Khiem from South Can Tho University.

Key informants in this case study include

      Mr. Le Hoang Nhan, Vice Chairman of Dong Hung B Commune

      Mr. Tran Van Ha – head of Vam Xang Hamlet

      Ms. Tran Dieu Hien, Vice Chairwoman of Dong Hung B Red Cross

      Mrs. Vo Thi Hoa – beneficiary, single headed elder woman

      Mrs. Nguyen Thi Gioi, beneficiary

      Mr. Hong, beneficiary

      Mr. Le Ngoc Tho, Chairman of Vinh Trung Commune

      Mr. Truong Trong Nghia, project assistant, Vinh Trung Commune staff

      Mr. Nguyen Tan Lap, Chairman of Vinh Trung Red Cross

      Mr. Chau Bot – head of Vinh Tay hamlet, Khmer

      Mrs. Nguyen Thi Thu Ha, beneficiary

      Mr. Huynh Kim Long, beneficiary

      Ms. Tran Thi Nuong, beneficiary, Khmer